Title: Urban Regenerative Development in South Africa: The Role of Place and Story
Author(s): Matthew Healey
Institution(s): University of Melbourne, Melbourne, Australia
Email(s): mphealey@hotmail.com
Publisher: Global Cities Research Institute, RMIT University, Melbourne, Australia
Year: 2013
Editor(s): Paul James, Chris Hudson, Sam Carroll-Bell, Alyssa Taing

Series URL: http://global-cities.info/news-events/conferences-forums/conferences-proceedings
Urban Regenerative Development in South Africa: The Role of Place and Story

MATTHEW HEALEY

Abstract: This paper examines the central role that ‘Place’ and ‘Story’ holds in regenerative development using examples from a study of a redevelopment project in the Central Business District (Pretoria) of the City of Tshwane, South Africa. This paper explores the perceived role that a space holds for street vendors and the local and national governments for the redevelopment space. This paper also clarifies the rationale of ‘Place’ and ‘Story’ in the regenerative development process for the purposes of planning. The study indicates that the street vendors primarily view the space as a source of income. From the governmental perspective the space holds potential for economic regeneration in an effort to achieve a state of excellence of for the city, but fails to acknowledge the role that those occupying the space can play. The paper argues that by reconciling rather than compromising these differences, positive regenerative outcomes are possible. These outcomes would allow for governmental priorities and the needs of the people in the future to be met in a manner that is positive and inclusionary, without sacrificing the needs of those in the present.

1. Introduction

Cities are hubs of social, economic, and ecological threads weaving together to form an interconnected fabric interacting in a space. Within this fabric people interact and undertake activities based on their interpretation of what that particular space should be used for. Regeneration projects are one method that stakeholders (typically governments) can use to alter the fabric that constitutes cities in pursuit of change, either to change the perceived vocation, or to alter some aspect of it. The purpose of this paper is to initiate a discussion into whether differing interpretation of a spaces purpose can influence regeneration. This has been done through an exploration of a proposed regeneration project in the Central Business District (CBD) of the City of Pretoria in the Tshwane Municipality, South Africa.

First, this paper provides some background on regenerative development, and how regeneration reconciles with sustainability. Secondly, the paper examines the concept of ‘Place’ and its role in regenerative development. Thirdly, an examination of the use of ‘Story’ as a means of rediscovering Place and understanding the perceived vocation of an area by stakeholders is provided and the idea of contested place is introduced. Fourthly, an introduction to a reconciliatory measure known as the ‘Law of Three’ is provided as a possible resolution tool where contested place exists. Fifthly, results from a study into the perceived role of a space in the Tshwane CBD by street vendors and the local and national
governments are provided. Finally, the implications of the difference in story held by these two groups are discussed within the context of Place and subsequently its influence in regenerative development. The goal is to show that true regeneration in situations of conflicting Story derives from the achievement of a reconciled shared vision for a Place, and is not just contingent on achieving the goals of redevelopment projects.

2. **Reconciling ‘regeneration’ and ‘sustainability’**

John Tillman Lyle advocated for designing of development for ecosystem restoration and urban greening (1994). This approach was one of the earliest manifestations of the regenerative paradigm for the built environment. The holistic approach differs from the business as usual development paradigm, which reduces systems to their component parts for optimization and efficiency. The optimization of systems so as to reduce the amount of resources used and pollution produced occupies what Pedersen Zari and Jenkin refer to as eco-efficiency (or the popular green/sustainable paradigm) (2010). These tools are important as they allow for more immediate reductions of impacts on the environment and an improvement in human health within the existing building design and production paradigm (Pedersen Zari 2009). However, these tools should not be seen as an end result, but rather steps in the transformative journey towards a more regenerative paradigm (Cole 2012).

Regenerative development does not have to be considered at odds with sustainability, rather sustainability principles can be seen as underlying (or sustaining) the ability for regeneration. *Figure 1* depicts this reconciled principle, adapted from *Levels of Work* by Krone (1992, cited in Mang and Reed 2012). Beneath the dotted line are the ‘maintain’ and ‘operate’ principles that concern themselves with what is in existence, what Mang and Reed (2012) associate with sustainability. The ‘improve’ and ‘regenerate’ principles focus on potential (what exists but not yet manifested) (Mang and Reed 2012). Thus, sustainability in this approach underpins regeneration in that it maintains (sustains) and facilitates ‘work’ at higher levels on potential.

![Figure 1: The Levels of Work (Krone 1992, cited in Mang and Reed 2012)](image)

Regenerative development in practice can take narrower forms than the concept presented above. Some refer specifically to the conversion of former industrial areas into housing, retail space, or public space (Lovering 2007), rather than (for example) restoration of ecosystems.
Other approaches have focused purely on socio-economic outcomes, as opposed to biophysical (Couch and Dennemann 2000). Whilst these can still be construed as regeneration, regenerative development offers a much deeper and broader potential for positive change.

Often words such as ‘renewal’, ‘regenerate’, and ‘repair’, are presented as synonymous in regeneration projects and government policy, but what does their meaning imply? Table 1 holds the definitions for some of these key words, taken from Oxford Dictionaries.

**Table 1:** Definition of key words associated with regeneration projects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Meaning</th>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Reactivate</td>
<td>Restore to a state of activity; bring back into action</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Repair</td>
<td>Restore to a good condition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restore</td>
<td>The action of returning something to a former owner, place, or condition</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Renewal</td>
<td>The replacement or repair of something</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Redevelop</td>
<td>Develop again or differently</td>
<td>½</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revival</td>
<td>An improvement in the condition, strength, or fortunes of something</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revitalize</td>
<td>Imbue with new life and vitality</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Regenerate</td>
<td>Bring new and more vigorous life to an area, industry, institution, etc.</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Oxford Dictionaries

These words, often used interchangeably, fall into two distinct themes. Theme 1 refers to returning something to a previous state, how it was, and a return to the ‘old ways’. Theme 2 refers to the ‘new’—giving something a new essence, or improving it somehow. Note that ‘redevelop’ could arguably fall into either Theme 1 or Theme 2. The partnering of this term with regenerate (ie. regenerative development) holds significance when considering projects in already developed areas. For example, in New York City a derelict aboveground train line was converted into a green space, encompassing the social (via public space provision), economic (property value increase and enabling space for small business), and ecological (returning the environment to the space) (Friends of the High Line 2012). The phrase regenerative development should not be treated as a single approach, but rather viewed as a broad term from which multiple approaches can be derived.

That being said, not that all approaches are positive. For example, the Lavapiés neighbourhood in Madrid was ‘regenerated’ to create more housing and the creation of new public facilities. However, after several years of implementation it became apparent that the project was actually orientated at the middle class and as part of developing the city’s tourism industry. This was at the expense of the financially poorer inhabitants, who were progressively squeezed out as the area underwent gentrification (Díaz Orueta 2007). As such while it may have been re-developmental it was not done so in a manner that regenerates.

Pedersen (*et al.* 2010) define regenerative development as an investigation into how humans can participate in ecosystems through development, to create optimum health for both human communities and other living organisms and systems.

Others see the goal of regenerative development as to design and construct in a participatory manner with the natural environment, not in competition with it (Reed 2007). This in turn enables the capacities of people to co-evolve in harmony with the ecological system in a
place (Mang cited in Cole et al. 2012). This co-evolution with ecological systems becomes possible by treating nature as a partner within the development framework, according it the ability to influence the design process. These two views are the perspective that is being taken in this paper.

Central to the ideas of Regenesis (2008b) and Pedersen (et al. 2010) is the bounding of regenerative development within a ‘place’. For example, the built environment includes community, cultural, and ecological experiences within the same area (or space). These experiences influence the evolution of the built environment and result in the essence of a location, what Pedersen (et al. 2010) calls a ‘sense of place’. Thus, how can we define the distinction between space and place more generally, for regenerative development? Moreover, how can this essence of place be captured for the purposes of applied regenerative development?

3. ‘Place’, ‘space’ and ‘story’

Given the significance of Place in regenerative development, it is important to distinguish the difference between a ‘space’ and a ‘place’.

‘A conference hall and a theatre may share similar spatial features ... yet we rarely sing or dance when presenting conference papers ... we wouldn’t describe this behaviour as “out of space”, but it would most certainly be “out of place”’ (Harrison and Dourish 1996, p. 69).

Thus, a ‘space’ is what it is physically, but a ‘place’ transcends this and is what it is used for, interpreted, and/or feels. For example, the difference between a house, and a home; a house keeps out the wind and the rain, but a home is for living (Harrison and Dourish 1996). Another example would be travelling, some cities feel different to others, and oftentimes this is feeling is not easily describable or discernable. Thus, space becomes a ‘place’ not because it is constructed, but because it develops an accumulation of meanings for people. It includes individual and community relationships that link outwardly into the wider world (Hildreth 2007). Place is the essence of a space, the representation of innumerable connections between the past, present, and future using social, cultural and ecological threads (Harrison and Dourish 1996, Pedersen et al. 2010, Regenesis 2008). This complexity also makes it difficult to conceptualize Place for the purposes of development. However, organizations such as Regenesis and the Story of Place Institute (SoPI) have developed methodologies to conceptualize Place.

Organizations such as Regenesis use the ‘Story of Place’ methodology (Regenesis n.d.) as a tool in their regenerative development framework to capture the essence of a place in a narrative format. The Story of Place Institute (SoPI) use their own Story of Place method as a unifying tool for neighbourhood revitalization and regeneration. The story of the place is the coherent organization of common patterns throughout the different dimensions (eg. ecological data, whole of their research into a place, using which interviews with local residents) (SoPI 2010). Similarly, Regenesis view a story as,

‘a coherent organization of information and the relationships and connections ... These are related in a way that reveals a holistic, understandable picture’ (n.d., para. 4).
Both organizations highlight that the story allows for the ‘uniqueness’ of a place, the complex interweaving of human and natural interactions over time, to be related. More simply, a story is where large amounts of data can be condensed and ordered for ease of understanding and planning for the future. A space provides the geographic bounds for a story, thus story provides the means by which space transforms into place.

However, not every space is necessarily acknowledged as a place (particularly by those who are disconnected from that space, eg. governments). That is where groups such as SoPI come into play, to facilitate the act of place rediscovery.

The use of a story can also be multi-purposed. For example, Regenesis used the method as a part of the Loreto Bay Villages redevelopment project in Mexico. During the planning phases they showed how a degraded estuary— if the project work was completed in such a way as to not interfere with the natural processes of the area— would actually be beneficial for the area through fish production, not to mention creating an appealing space for tourists (Regenesis n.d.b). Another example from SoPI was the use of Story of Place to act as a bridge between culturally divided groups in North Fork Valley, Colorado, USA. By enabling the groups to discover the unique character about the place they occupied they were able to engage in dialogues about what they mutually cared about. Story of Place therefore, ‘serves as a unifying vision for the community to work together toward a common future’ (SoPI 2012a).

The importance of these methods is that they enabled the groups to rediscover what already existed, the essence of place. Key aspects in both methods were the importance of community involvement to the outcome. Indeed, Hoxie (et al. 2012) emphasizes that community dialogue is essential for regenerative development. Given that, for the most part, the regeneration process is largely controlled from the ‘outside’— eg. politicians, developers, who themselves do not occupy the space targeted for regeneration (Evans 2005)— effective community involvement is key.

Another aspect of the story concept is that of interconnection, that ‘Place arises from the rich connections among the earth, local nature, and spirit’ (Regenesis n.d.). Part of this relationship is the role of history. In the context of this paper the role that apartheid has played in altering the socio-economical fabric of South Africa is a key part of the story. It has been argued that the forging a new society in South Africa requires agreement on the ugliness of apartheid (Nytagodien and Neal 2004), that does not mean forgetting what occurred, but acknowledging what apartheid did in the creation of the story of a place for South Africans. Moreover, apartheid altered the socio-economic layout of many South African cities, including Pretoria, and as such acknowledging apartheid’s impact is essential in the regeneration process.

4. Reconciling difference

In the above noted Story of Place Institute example, it was noted that they assisted two different groups to reconcile through discovery of commonalities in their different stories. Clashing stories have arisen spatially in the literature under the banner of contested space (Morrissey and Gaffikin 2006), whereby groups have different social constructions that rely
on the interconnections between space, personal identity, and politics (Tajbakhsh 2001, cited in Morrissey and Gaffikin 2006). However, in the context of this paper it is argued that these spaces are more akin to ‘contested places’, whereby the different threads that make up the space’s essence are interpreted differently.

Morrissey and Gaffikin (2006) refer to two different types of contested space, which for the sake of space will not be explored here, however both forms experience the use of space as ‘exclusionary space’. This harks back to the South African context in that the apartheid influenced planning regime laid out cities in a way that enabled groups to move around without having to cross paths with individuals of other boroughs (Williams 2000). Related to this is the role of the community in the story of place plays an important role in regenerative development, however as rightly pointed out by Hoxie (et al. 2012) empowering a community also involves a risk—community’s response cannot be guaranteed to be in line with preconceptions in the project. However, this risk need not be construed as a negative. Rather, what is needed is a framework that not only allows for reconciling these disagreements, but also allows for projects to move forward in a manner that is still regenerative. Regenesis has one such framework, referred to as the Law of Three (Figure 2).

![Figure 2: Law of three](Source: Regenesis (n.d.))

This framework operates as a mental model for consciously and simultaneously valuing paradoxical or conflicting ideas (the ‘activating’ and ‘restraining’) so as to allow for a better idea than either of the conflicting ideas to enter (the reconciling) (Regenesis n.d.). The Regenesis explanation for each of the three forces is provided in Table 2.

**Table 2: Explanation for each of the three forces**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Force</th>
<th>Explanation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Activating</td>
<td>Derives from the impulse to produce some-thing new.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Restraining</td>
<td>Comes from the impulse to have things a particular way, to be unique, and to be complete and whole.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reconciling</td>
<td>Comes from the impulse to provide or increase the value or benefit for all levels of systems.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Regenesis (n.d.)
The benefits of reconciliatory measures, such as the Law of Three Forces over other dispute resolution methodologies, lie in their ability to forge a more unified vision. This is achieved by allowing the parties involved to develop a full appreciation for the opposing force—the purpose and value that is has to the larger situation, in this context the redevelopment project.

5. Pretoria CBD: Context and methodology

The city of Pretoria is one of the country’s three capital cities, and serves as the administrative head of the nation. It is contained within the City of Tshwane Metropolitan Municipality (CoTMM). In 2005 Pretoria was approved to change its name to Tshwane, though the inner city is still commonly referred to as Pretoria.

![Picture 1: Pretoria, Gauteng Province, South Africa](source: Mimi Davey)

It is an urban area that the local government is keen to regenerate to achieve a vision as an ‘African Capital City of Excellence’ (CoTMM 2011, p. 101). These changes are in line with the National Development Plan (NDP) (NPC 2012a) and the Integrated Development Plan (IDP) (CoTMM 2011), which presents governmental perspectives and approaches on how the country and its urban areas should plan for the future and redress the apartheid-era developments. Given the scope of a story of a place’ this paper intentionally focuses only on facets of the story that appear to be the most influential for these two groups. This is based on scoping data gathered through semi-structured interviews with 11 street vendors based within the redevelopment area (CoTMM 2010) and document analysis of the NDP (country-wide), and the IDP (Tshwane-specific) publications. The street vendors were all South African nationals and the gender split was relatively even (six male, five female). Secondary data was also gathered from newspaper articles to offset concerns raised by Bowen (2009) regarding insufficient detail and selectivity in document analysis.

6. Results

6.1 Reliance and relationships

The street vendor’s homes were generally located along the fringe areas of Pretoria, in particular from areas like Soshanguve (33 kilometres from the city centre) and Atteridgeville (14 kilometres from the city centre). Both of these suburbs are the product of the racialized character of land use patterns in cities in apartheid-era South Africa (Williams 2000).
Vendor relationships described ranged in strength; only three vendors actually referenced their surrounding vendors as being friends. Most were on amicable terms, due in part to the ability for vendors to change money with each other (reciprocal generosity): ‘we only know them by face ... we don’t know each other’s names, but we help one another.’ Unfriendly competition was fairly common, mainly due to product duplication: ‘[other vendors] give us problems if you sell the same products’; ‘[the relationship is] not too good, because they sell the same goods’; and ‘we just greet each other as neighbours, but that’s it.’ The physical proximity of stalls potentially exacerbates the issue of product duplication (see Picture 2).

Picture 2: Vendors stalls
Source: Mimi Davey

Relationships described as friendly were due to no product duplication, ‘she is selling her stuff and I’m selling other stuff”, or because vendors have built relationships over long time periods, ‘yeah I have known them for years, we are friends’. Conversely from a customer perspective, there was little indication that vendors experienced or possessed a regular customer base; rather their reliance was on heavy pedestrian traffic for sales, which reportedly often varied.

6.2 Government and space

Part of the redevelopment projects implementation was the relocation or removal of street vendors from their workspace. The implications that this would have for incomes were dismissed by the executive mayor who said that the move was not aimed at preventing people from making a living but to ensure that people operated in a safe and secure environment (Hlahla 2012, para. 4).

The main concern for the vendors interviewed was with a sudden new rent requirement: ‘they are no longer giving [a space to vend] to us, we have to pay each and every month but they don’t offer us anything.’ Additionally there was a distinct lack of facilities being provided given that vendors were now paying rent, ‘We don’t get anything. Nothing. They just want money only.’
Furthermore, vendors displayed a lack of trust in the government due to unfulfilled promises, including providing facilities for use by the vendors, ‘They are so disappointing because they tell us promises but at the end they don’t keep their promises. They lead us and they can’t treat us fairly.’

In the interview vendors noted aspects they either liked or did not like about the area in which they worked. Responses ranged from quite general, ‘it’s ok’, to ‘I just like it because I didn’t have any alternative’. Those that had positives for the area (approximately half the respondents) were satisfied with the areas aesthetics, and in particular its potential for business as there is a large amount of pedestrian traffic. Not all vendors were happy being in the area, but did acknowledge that ‘…the place must be very nice for the [customers].’

Half of the vendors had cited safety as an issue to be tackled, in particular because safety for customers is a precursor to good business, ‘the place must be attractive for the customers ... But sometimes the customers they are unsafe’. Moreover, business fluctuations are common, peak times for sale occur on ‘payday’, and generally around weekends, however upheavals in other industries such as strikes reduce the amount of sales vendors can make. Nine of the eleven vendors cited their stall as their only source of income. Previous studies into street vendors in Pretoria and surrounding areas have confirmed a similar finding (Brandt 2002, Nel et al. 2009). Obtaining alternative employment options were either not common or unwanted, with one vendor noting that the industry was better than other options closer to home (like workshops or manual labour).

### 6.3 Articulating vision, identity, and trust

In articulating a vision for the country the National Planning Commission has laid the groundwork for change. Nationally the goal for South Africa is the reduction of poverty by 2030, and the NDP lays out the theme-by-theme goals that inform this overall target. The NDP does not specify the methods that local governments may use; rather it is trying to convey an aspiration that the populace can strive for.

The underlying principle behind the eradication of poverty in this instance is job creation. This is achieved by increasing economic growth and transforming the economy to create decent work and hence sustainable livelihoods. What the NDP does not do is specify how this is to be achieved. The NDP presents itself as a unifying document, acknowledging the past inequalities apartheid imposed, but emphasizing how this contributes to the national identity:
‘we have learned a great deal from our complex past; adding continuously to our experience of being African’ (NPC 2012a, p. 13).

To ensure that major changes to the socio-economic direction of the country are favourable the NDP advocates the use of social compacts, a form of social contract. The creation of which can be seen as a method for garnering public participation, ‘the idea of a social compact is a relatively simple one: all stakeholders buy into a clearly articulated vision ... and all parties should believe that the necessary sacrifices are relatively equitably shared amongst all participants’ (NPC 2012a, p. 475). One of the core tenets of the NDP is that most of the jobs will come from small businesses. This plan is about transformation and contains recommendations to achieve a virtuous cycle of confidence and trust, a growing economy and broadening of opportunities (NPC 2012a, p. 458).

The IDP also presents a vision, in this case for Tshwane, to become the African Capital City of Excellence. The IDP is more practical in focus in that it has a specific lifecycle of 5 years (2011-2016) and can be reviewed. Its purpose is to outline achievable goals in this timeframe that inform the mission stated previously. They aim to empower the citizens of Tshwane, enabling employment through job creation, mainly through infrastructure projects. The overall mission of Tshwane is,

‘to sustainably enhance the quality of life of all people in Tshwane through a developmental system of local government and by rendering efficient, effective and affordable services’ (CoTMM 2011, p. 101).

However, the IDP is not so much depicting an identity for the citizens of Tshwane, but rather is crafting an identity for the Municipality itself, ‘Tshwane is the African meeting place and a truly international capital city’ (CoTMM 2011, p. 102). Key indicators for this include, ‘It is a city that does not sleep’—similar tag line exists for cities in developed countries such as New York City in the USA. In a news article there was reference to Lilian Ngoyi Square (Picture 4) being remade into ‘a place of bright neon colours and giant digital screens, Times Square-style’ (Makoni 2012, para. 1). There is no indication if such a project is planned, given that other plans for the same space have included a market for informal traders and a women’s memorial (Hlahla 2013, para. 15).

![Picture 4: Lilian Ngoyi Square](source: Mimi Davey)
The purpose of the IDP is to,

‘improve the quality of life for people living in the City of Tshwane (CoT) area—also reflecting on issues of national and provincial importance. One of the key imperatives was to seek alignment with national and provincial priorities, politics and strategies’ (CoTMM 2011, p. 1).

The only references to street vendors are that a small number are to receive training so they can be transformed into formal businesses. According to one article, earlier efforts to regulate vendors had left some people unemployed, forcing them to resort to crime (Pretoria News 2012, para. 10). In terms of public participation, the IDP states that the public participation process was conducted in 2010, though there is no further detail on what comprised this process. The IDP indicates that there will be skills development and support to small, medium, and micro enterprises, cooperatives and the informal sector as incubation of small business is an important element of this support (commonly termed ‘Local Economic Development’ (LED)).

The City of Tshwane states on the redevelopment projects webpage that a ‘multifaceted approach that integrates a myriad of factors across the total urban spectrum is needed to regenerate a complex and diverse space as the inner city’ (2010, para. 3). According to the same webpage informal traders are ‘being engaged and informed of the programme and how they will be affected’, moreover it is the responsibility of the LED Department to identify a long-term solution and move traders to markets (CoTMM 2010, para. 7). This pronouncement runs counter to report that informal traders have been angered by the move that prevents them from making a living (Hlahla 2012a).

7. Discussion

The street vendors did not explicitly state a story (ie. perceived role) for the redevelopment site. Rather unconsciously they assigned the site a role based on their interpretation of the character of the space (the assigning of the role in turn makes it a ‘place’ to the vendors). The patterns that emerge from the street vendor’s responses indicate three key themes of relevance for the redevelopment site, which, in-turn, influence the role they perceive for the space. This role in all three themes regards the space as the provider of income, and thus provider of livelihood for the vendors.

Similar to the vendors the government has not explicitly stated a story for the sites vocation. More broadly, the government has determined an appropriate post-apartheid path forward, vision, and development for the citizens of South Africa. This will be achieved through economic growth and job creation to lift citizens out of poverty, redress the ills of the past, and improve the quality of life for people in Tshwane, and South Africa more broadly. Thus, the methods for job creation include implementation of large-scale infrastructure projects, education and training to up skill citizens, and facilitating Local Economic Development (LED).

From the street vendor perspective there is little in the way of social value in the area, whilst there are good relationships among the vendors this is challenged by unfriendly competition due to ease of product replication. This is an exhibition of the copycat mentality as identified by Woodward (et al. 2011) whereby individuals identify relatively successful business
opportunities and set up similar businesses in the same locality. This has only been exacerbated with the relocation which has compacted vendors into smaller spaces. Moreover, charging rent for spaces without the provision of facilities has upset many of the interviewed vendors. The vendors have little in the way of other income, thus restricting or removing this source of income would have dire consequences for their livelihood. General dissatisfaction among vendors with the area is high; particularly given the government’s approaches to their presence (such as stating they will provide facilities but the facilities never arrive). Vendors cite the work as tolerable given some of the alternatives (e.g. workshops/manual labour)—particularly amongst the women interviewed.

The decent amount of foot traffic provides customers for the vendors, though they are highly reliant on regular traffic given that there does not appear to be much in the way of return customers. The vendors were eager to see the government follow through on their promises for better facilities, the lack of which has led to a serious undermining in credibility and ultimately trust for the local government. Many of the changes that vendors would like to see for the area focus on making the area more appealing to customers through aesthetic and amenity improvements.

Street vending provides entrepreneurial opportunities to people who cannot afford fixed premises. Bromley refers to these types of businesses as the ‘bottom run in the ladder of upward economic mobility’ (2000, p. 5). Two of the 11 interviewed vendors owned multiple businesses, which may be an indication of such a phenomenon. Many of the vendors referenced now having to pay rent to the government. Questions arise from this as to whether it is an indirect means of forcing vendors to relocate, or to discourage congestion, a common problem in street vendor-heavy locales (Bromley 2000). Thus, for the street vendors the site constitutes a means of obtaining a livelihood that is not reliant on manual labour or workshops, enables vendors to maintain business networks with suppliers, and ultimately provide a service for pedestrians in the CBD.

While the government has articulated that it has a ‘shared vision’ for the country (NPC 2012) the pushback from street vendors regarding the changes to the spaces they occupy in the Pretoria CBD, and subsequent impact on their livelihoods, suggests that the practical applications of the vision are anything but shared (Du Preez and Kahimbaara 2012). Despite indicating a preference for ground-up economic development in the NDP and IDP it appears to be a reluctance to accept informal trade in the site area. Given the focus on job creation in the NDP and IDP as a means of raising standards of living it appears there is a disconnect in the interpretation for how these plans should be implemented. The reclamation of the site is meant to act as a stimulus for investment and growth in the CBD as a means of creating jobs, particularly in the manual labour and infrastructure sphere.

Horn finds that many people turn to street vending due to an inability to access these jobs that are created (2011). Thus, the role for the CBD is to act as a catalyst for economic growth which will in turn promote change. This is where the site for Operation Reclaim is relevant as this is an area slate for a mechanistically-orientated economic regeneration, however the street vendors are considered ‘in-the-way’ as opposed to being a part of the existing fabric. Conversely, Lyons and Snoxell argue that governments should concentrate on creating an enabling environment for the informal sector (2005) so that people have opportunities to work on achieving their own potential. Many of the governmental aspirations in these documents focus far into the future, however fail to take into account the present. Very little reference is given to those that are directly affected by forced relocation; rather this is seen as
necessary within the grand plan for economic growth. Further information regarding post-relocation of the vendors—as part of a larger local economic development strategy—was lacking. This should be concerning for the government as Lyons and Snoxell (2005) have found that local economic development in practice is not as efficient as it is often thought despite its prevalence in policy.

That being said, there were some commonalities between the stories of the street vendors, and those of the government, which deserve consideration. As established retaining a decent source of livelihood is of concern for the street vendors. Similarly, the government is eager to facilitate economic growth, indeed it’s one of their guiding principles post-apartheid. Where the two sides do not link up though is in the method, principally because the government does not see a role for the vendors in the CBD. This is where the Law of Three is valuable as a resolution tool. Frameworks such as the Law of Three by Regenesis enable stakeholders (in this case particularly the government) to conceptualize the value of alternate views. In the context of regeneration projects these tools would be most useful when decision makers are confronted with groups such as street vendors in redevelopment sites. Table 3 depicts an example of the reconciled figure. Such reconciliation would be a positive step forward for South Africa, and go some way towards restoring the vendor’s faith in the government as it shows that their concerns and wellbeing have been factored into the broader regeneration project.

**Table 3:** Law of Three with example forces from the study

| Activating | Governmental desire to expiate the past and reduce poverty for its citizens through economic development. |
| Restraining | Street vendor desire to remain vending in an area that experiences high levels of foot traffic as a means of providing a livelihood |
| Reconciling | Full integration of vendors into the urban fabric as a part of an ‘African Capital City of Excellence’ through recognition of their role in economic development. |

**Conclusion**

Williams (2000) states that cities in South Africa reflect the state of the nation and welfare of their people, and because of this, the future for South Africa will be found primarily in its cities. Thus, South African cities are striving for measures that enable them to reach their potential as envision by their national governments (Turok and Parnell 2009). Regenerative development is one strategy that can be used by governments to alter the fabric that constitutes cities. However, regenerative development requires consideration of what that space means to those that occupy it (consideration of their ‘place’). Tshwane is a city that still suffers from the racialized planning practices of apartheid and so regenerative practices need to be conscious of this history. Attempts to redress these past ills have focused predominantly on economic development and capacity building from a top-down perspective. From the research undertaken to explore facets of two group’s perspectives of story for a proposed redevelopment site it emerged that the perceived vocation of the space for these two groups did not sync.

The question being explored here was whether these differing views can influence regeneration. If the goal of regeneration as envisaged by groups such as Regenesis is the ability to realize potential whilst maintaining the current (eg. Levels of Work, Figure 1), then
regeneration projects must be applied as the practical push towards such realization. While projects may have a specific objective that does not mean that they cannot embody the essence of regeneration. Regenerative development in of itself has an essence, a vocation, and for that vocation to be employed projects must be inclusionary, not exclusionary, to achieve their objectives. If plans call for street vendors to be removed because of their occupation and spirit they have then perhaps it should be considered that the vendor is not in the wrong, but the project.

Ultimately, in situations such as this street vendors constitute but one stakeholder among many. Their positive inclusion is an essential part of the regenerative process and until that inclusion occurs regeneration in its truest form is unlikely to occur.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank my research project supervisors, Dr Dominique Hes and Elena Bondareva, for their support and advice. I would also like to thank my fellow students and friends: Alison Stoakley, Alberto Garza Barragan, and Goli Habibi Kenari.

References


Regenesis (n.d), Story of Place, Regenesis Group, Santa Fe [online], <http://www.regenesisgroup.com/Services/StoryofPlace>.

Regenesis (n.d), Case Studies, Regenesis Group, Santa Fe, [online], <http://www.regenesisgroup.com/CaseStudies>.

Regenesis (n.d), Regenerative Development, Regenesis Group, Santa Fe, [online], <http://www.regenesisgroup.com/RegenerativeDevelopment>.

Regenesis (n.d), Law of Three, Regenesis Group, Santa Fe, [online], <http://www.regenesisgroup.com/userfiles/Law%20of%20Three%20Forces%20Handout.pdf>.

Story of Place Institute (SoPI) (2010), Story of Place Institute: Discover, Santa Fe, [online], <http://storyofplace.org/Discover.html>.

Story of Place Institute (SoPI) (2012a), Story of Place Institute: About, Santa Fe, [online], <http://storyofplace.org/Aboutus.html>.

Story of Place Institute (SoPI) (2012b), Story of Place Institute: Our Process, Santa Fe, [online], <http://storyofplace.org/Our_Process.html>.

Story of Place Institute (SoPI) (n.d.), Story of Place Institute: North Folk Valley, Santa Fe, [online], <http://storyofplace.org/North_Fork_Valley.html>.
